Introduction

The histone code hypothesis proposes that covalent modifications of specific residues provide interaction surfaces for proteins that either increase or decrease chromatin accessibility and that this in turn impacts on the regulation of transcription, replication, and chromosome behavior (Strahl and Allis, 2000; Jenuwein and Allis, 2001). Considerable progress has been made in identifying key modifications such as acetylation, methylation, phosphorylation, and ubiquitylation and in determining their association with either open (eu-) chromatin or repressed (hetero-) chromatin states (reviewed in Turner, 2002). In many cases, enzymes/complexes have been identified that either add or remove specific modifications, for example histone acetylases (HATs), histone deacetylases (HDACs), and histone methyltransferases (HMTases). In addition, proteins or domains have been identified that recognize and bind modified histone surfaces: for example, heterochromatin protein 1 (HP1), which is implicated in defining or perpetuating a heterochromatic structure, recognizes histone H3 di- or trimethylated at lysine (K) 9 (Lachner et al., 2001; Bannister et al., 2001). In addition to the role of modifications at individual sites, synergism between different modifications is also key in terms of defining function. An example of this is provided by the requirement for H2B ubiquitylation for H3-K4 and H3-K79 methylation in \textit{S. cerevisiae} (Sun and Allis, 2002; Dover et al., 2002; Briggs et al., 2002).

The function of some histone modifications has not yet been determined. A notable example is ubiquitylation of histone H2A, which occurs at lysine 119 in many but not all higher eukaryotes (Goldknopf et al., 1975; Nickel and Davie, 1989). Ubiquitylated H2A (uH2A) has been estimated to comprise between 5% and 15% of the available H2A and is therefore a relatively abundant modification. However, there is contradictory evidence concerning its function. Some studies have pointed to an association of uH2A with transcriptionally active chromatin (Levinger and Varshavsky, 1982; Nickel et al., 1989). Others, however, have failed to demonstrate such a link (Huang et al., 1986; Parlow et al., 1990; Dawson et al., 1991). Moreover, Baarends et al. (1999) reported that uH2A is abundant in mouse pachytene spermatocytes and is enriched on the transcriptionally silent XY body.

Genetic screens in \textit{D. melanogaster} identified the Polycomb group (PcG) and Trithorax group (TrG) of proteins as memory factors involved, respectively, in heritable silencing and heritable activation of homeotic genes. A number of PcG proteins have been assigned to one or two large multiprotein complexes. In \textit{D. melanogaster}, the 2 MDa PRC1 complex contains stoichiometric amounts of Polyhomeotic (PH), Polycomb (PC), Posterior sex combs (PSC), and dRING (Shao et al., 1999; Francis et al., 2001), and the 600 kDa PRC2 complex contains ESC, E(Z), and SU(Z)12 (Muller et al., 2002). In
mammals, the same two complexes have been identified, although there are multiple homologs for each of the PRC1 PcG proteins.

The PRC2 complex has been shown to catalyze trimethylation of histone H3-K27 (Czermin et al., 2002; Muller et al., 2002; Cao et al., 2002; Kuzmichev et al., 2002; Fischle et al., 2003; Min et al., 2003). Interestingly, the PRC1 protein Polycomb (PC) has a chromodomain that recognizes trimethylated H3-K27 (tri-meH3-K27) (Cao et al., 2002; Kuzmichev et al., 2002; Fischle et al., 2003; Min et al., 2003), and it has been suggested that this interaction could result in recruitment of PRC1 complexes to PRC2 targets. The molecular mechanism of PRC1 function is poorly understood but is thought to involve inhibition of SWI/SNF chromatin remodeling (Shao et al., 1999). Two of the core PRC1 proteins, PSC and dRING, have a Ring finger domain. This motif is characteristic of ubiquitin and SUMO E3 ligases (reviewed in Pickart, 2001).

Model systems that have been useful in unraveling the links between histone modifications and biological function include well-studied gene loci (for example, the α- and β-globin gene clusters) and regions comprising either constitutive heterochromatin (for example, centromeres and telomeres) or facultative heterochromatin, in particular the inactive X chromosome (Xi) in female mammals. In this latter example, there is a developmentally regulated and stepwise conversion of an entire X chromosome from a euchromatic to a heterochromatic conformation (reviewed in Heard, 2004). The process is triggered by the expression and in cis localization of a large noncoding RNA, the X inactive specific transcript (Xist) (Brown et al., 1991, 1992; Brockdorff et al., 1992). Xist RNA is thought to elicit chromosome silencing by recruiting chromatin-modifying factors. Consistent with this, recent studies have demonstrated that Xist RNA recruits PRC2 PcG complexes with resultant chromosome-wide H3-K27 trimethylation (Mak et al., 2002; Silva et al., 2003; Plath et al., 2003; Kohlmaier et al., 2004). This in turn has been shown to be required for stable long-term maintenance of X inactivation (Wang et al., 2001; Silva et al., 2003).

In this study, we demonstrate that a subset of PRC1 proteins, including the Ring finger proteins Mel18 and Ring1B, are transiently enriched on Xi in early development. Additionally, we show that Xi is highly enriched for uH2A and that this occurs coincident with PRC1 complex recruitment. Analysis of cells lacking Ring1B and the highly similar Ring1A proteins demonstrates that Ring1B is required to maintain global uH2A levels in ES cells and that Ring1A and Ring1B have an overlapping function in maintaining uH2A on Xi in differentiated cells. We discuss these results in the context of understanding the mechanism of action and evolution of PRC1 PcG proteins.

Results

Recruitment of PRC1 PcG Proteins to the Inactive X Chromosome

It has been proposed that the PRC1 and PRC2 PcG complexes are recruited to common sites as a result of an interaction between the chromodomain of the PRC1 protein PC and H3-K27 trimethylation (tri-meH3-K27) catalyzed by the PRC2 HMTase, EZ (Czermin et al., 2002; Muller et al., 2002; Cao et al., 2002; Kuzmichev et al., 2002; Fischle et al., 2003; Min et al., 2003). In a previous study, we reported that PRC2 is recruited to Xi in early development and that it is required to establish tri-meH3-K27 on Xi (Silva et al., 2003). However, we failed to detect enrichment of the PRC1 proteins Bmi1, Mpc2, or Ring1A either in early embryogenesis or at later stages (Mak et al., 2002; Silva et al., 2003). Because mammals have at least two homologs of each of the core PRC1 proteins, we extended this initial study using antisera specific to Ring1B, Mel18, Mph1, and Mph2. We first carried out immunofluorescence analysis on XX trophoblast stem (TS) cells, a model system for the imprinted X inactivation that occurs in extraembryonic tissues in mouse (Mak et al., 2002). Using antisera to the PRC2 proteins Suz12 or Eed to identify Xi domains, we observed Xi enrichment of Ring1B (Figure 1A) and also Mel18 and Mph2 (not shown). Scoring data illustrates that Ring1B enrichment on Xi is seen in the majority of cells, whereas Mel18, and in particular Mph2 enrichment, is less frequent (Figure 1A, graph).

We went on to determine if PRC1 enrichment on Xi occurs during in vitro differentiation of XX embryonic stem (ES) cells. This model system is representative of the random X inactivation that occurs in cells of the embryo proper and provides a useful means to analyze the dynamics of different steps of the X inactivation process. Previous studies have demonstrated that X inactivation proceeds in an ordered and stepwise process following the onset of Xist expression (reviewed in Heard, 2004). Recruitment of PRC2 proteins and consequent H3-K27 trimethylation is one of the earliest detectable changes. At later differentiation stages, Xi enrichment of PRC2 proteins is markedly reduced but H3-K27 trimethylation is retained (Silva et al., 2003; Plath et al., 2003). As shown in Figure 1B, a similar pattern was observed for the PRC1 proteins Ring1B, Mel18, and Mph1. Thus, recruitment to Xi occurs rapidly during early differentiation, but enrichment is undetectable at later differentiation stages. These findings suggest that a PRC1-like complex is recruited to Xi during the onset of X inactivation. The complex appears to utilize the homologous Mph1 and Mph2 proteins differently in TS cells compared with ES cells, suggesting that its composition may vary in a tissue-specific manner.

We went on to test if PRC1 protein enrichment on Xi occurs at the onset of X inactivation in early mouse embryos. Detection of the PRC2 protein Suz12 was used to identify Xi domains in XX embryos. A first wave of inactivation, initiated in early preimplantation embryos, results in imprinted inactivation of the paternal X chromosome (Xp) in all cells of late morula and early blastocyst stage embryos (Okamoto et al., 2004; Mak et al., 2004). We observed Ring1B localizing to Xi domains both in trophoderm and ICM regions of early blastocyst stage embryos (Figure 1C), indicating that PRC1 recruitment occurs during imprinted X inactivation in vivo. Imprinted X inactivation is reversed in cells allocated to the pluripotent epiblast lineage at the late blastocyst stage, setting the scene for subsequent random X inactivation in the embryo proper at approximately 6
days postcoitum (dpc). Consistent with this, we observed Xi localization of Ring1B in the majority of cells at 6.5 dpc (Figure 1D). At 7.5 dpc, there was a marked reduction, paralleling reduced enrichment of the PRC2 protein Suz12 on Xi. At 11.5 dpc, we failed to detect any localization to Xi domains (not shown). This progressive loss of Ring1B enrichment on Xi mirrors the results obtained for differentiating XX ES cells.
Ubiquitylation of Histone H2A on the Inactive X Chromosome

Both Mel18 and Ring1B proteins have Ring finger domains, indicating that they function either in ubiquitylation or sumoylation pathways. We therefore carried out immunostaining experiments to determine if either SUMO or ubiquitin groups are enriched on Xi. In initial experiments, we analyzed XX TS cells. To test if the Xi domain is enriched for ubiquitin, we used an antibody, FK2, which detects both mono- and polyubiquitin chains (Fujimuro et al., 1994). No Xi-specific signal was detected under conditions where cells are first fixed and then permeabilized (not shown). However, by reversing these two steps, a clear signal that colocalized with Xi was seen in all cells (Figure 2A). To discriminate between mono- and polyubiquitylated proteins, we used the FK1 antibody, which is specific for polyubiquitylated proteins (Fujimuro et al., 1994). Here, we also observed Xi signal but it was significantly weaker and was detectable in only 22% of cells (Figure 2B). Thus, both mono- and polyubiquitylated protein(s) are enriched in Xi domains but monoubiquitylated protein(s) predominate. No Xi signal was seen using antibodies to SUMO1 (not shown).

The stringent conditions required to expose the ubiquitin signal on Xi suggested that the epitope may be partially occluded. This, in turn, led us to consider that ubiquitylation may be occurring on a histone protein. The core histones H2A, H2B, and H3 and also histone H1 are all known to be subject to ubiquitylation (reviewed in Zhang, 2003). Ubiquitylated H2A (uH2A) represented a good candidate, as it is relatively abundant in higher eukaryotes, comprising 5%–15% of the total H2A. Availability of a highly specific monoclonal antibody (Vassilev et al., 1995) allowed us to test this hypothesis. As shown in Figure 2C, we observed a strong and highly specific staining of Xi domains in all cells. Thus, uH2A is highly enriched on Xi, providing a strong indication that this histone modification is associated with transcriptionally silent facultative heterochromatin. A fraction of uH2A has been reported to be polyubiquitylated (Nickel and Davie, 1989), possibly explaining the Xi staining seen with FK1 antibody (Figure 2B).

Although the uH2A staining pattern indicates that Xi is the major target site in XX TS cells, this strong signal masks a more general nuclear localization. This can be seen in immunofluorescence analysis of XY TS cells, where signal is detectable throughout the nucleoplasm except in nucleoli and DAPI-dense regions (Figure 2D). The latter observation indicates that H2A ubiquitylation is not a feature of constitutive heterochromatin. Western blot analysis shows that overall levels of uH2A are very similar in XX and XY TS cells (Figure 2E), suggesting that the contribution of uH2A on Xi is relatively small. We conclude from this that most uH2A is associated with sites dispersed throughout the genome.

Kinetics of H2A Ubiquitylation on the Inactive X Chromosome

To test for H2A ubiquitylation in random X inactivation and to examine the dynamics of this modification, we analyzed differentiating XX ES cells (Figure 3A). For these experiments, Xi domains were identified using antibodies to tri-meH3-K27. This provided a more reliable marker of Xi under the stringent conditions used to detect uH2A. As illustrated, H2A ubiquitylation detected with either FK2 or uH2A antibodies occurred with similar kinetics to PRC2-catalyzed H3-K27 trimethylation and PRC1 protein recruitment. Interestingly, uH2A on Xi was detectable on metaphase chromosomes, showing a banded pattern that colocalizes with tri-meH3-K27 (Figure 3A, lower panels). This pattern has been shown to relate to preferential localization of Xist RNA in gene-rich G-light bands (Duthie et al., 1999).
H2A Ubiquitylation and X Inactivation

667

Similarly, we observed uH2A on Xi in XX embryos at 11.5 dpc and in primary and transformed XX cell lines representing differentiated tissues (Figure 3B). We cannot rule out the possibility that relatively low levels of Ring1B, Mel18, and Mph1/2, or for that matter other PRC1 proteins, are associated with Xi in these situations.

Global levels of uH2A are similar in undifferentiated ES cells compared with cells differentiated for various times, contrasting with tri-meH3-K27, which is markedly elevated in undifferentiated ES cells (Figure 3C). The latter observation is consistent with previous studies demonstrating elevated PRC2 and tri-meH3-K27 both in ES cells and in the ICM of blastocyst stage embryos (Silva et al., 2003; Erhardt et al., 2003; Mak et al., 2004).

Differentiation Linked Stabilization of uH2A on the Inactive X Chromosome

To further examine the relationship between H2A ubiquitylation and the onset of X inactivation, we analyzed XY ES cell lines expressing an inducible Xist transgene. Previous studies have shown that expression of Xist transgenes in undifferentiated ES cells is sufficient to induce gene silencing and many of the chromatin modifications associated with X inactivation (Wutz and Jaenisch, 2000; Kohlmaier et al., 2004). We assayed Xist expression, recruitment of PRC2 (Suz12), PRC1 (Ring1B), H3-K27 trimethylation, and H2A ubiquitylation 72 hr following induction of Xist RNA in two independently derived ES cell lines, 8A and 12E (Figure 4A). Accumulation of Xist RNA into large nuclear domains occurred in the majority of cells in both cell lines. Recruitment of Suz12 and Ring1B and trimethylation of H3-K27 occurred in a reduced proportion of cells. Most strikingly, H2A ubiquitylation was detectable only in a very small proportion of cells.

Analysis of later stages of ES cell differentiation illustrates that uH2A enrichment is maintained on Xi beyond the time when PRC1 protein enrichment is detectable (compare Figures 1B and 3A graphs). Similarly, we observed uH2A on Xi in XX embryos at 11.5 dpc and in primary and transformed XX cell lines representing differentiated tissues (Figure 3B). We cannot rule out the possibility that relatively low levels of Ring1B, Mel18, and Mph1/2, or for that matter other PRC1 proteins, are associated with Xi in these situations.

Figure 3. H2A Ubiquitylation in Random X Inactivation

(A) Examples of immunofluorescence analysis illustrating ubiquitylated H2A (uH2A) and trimethylated H3-K27 (meK27) on Xi in differentiated ES cells at interphase (top) and on an individual Xi chromosome at metaphase (bottom). Scoring data (graph) illustrates differentiation-linked increase in uH2A on Xi, assessed both with uH2A and FK2 antibodies. The kinetics of H2A ubiquitylation closely mirrors that seen for trimethylation of H3-K27 (meK27). A minimum of 229 cells were scored for each point. Error bars indicate variation between slides.

(B) Graph illustrates data for various differentiated XX cell types: 11.5 dpc embryos, primary mouse embryo fibroblasts (MEF), primary mouse adult fibroblasts (MAF), and transformed fibroblast (TF) cell lines. The proportion of cells with Xi foci was scored using antibodies to tri-meH3-K27 (meK27) and to uH2A (FK2 and uH2A). A minimum of 193 cells were scored for each point. Error bars indicate variation between different slides.

(C) Western blot analysis of acid-extracted histones from undifferentiated PGK12.1 XX ES cells and from cells differentiated in vitro for 5 or 10 days (dd). The figure shows Coomassie brilliant blue staining of acid-extracted histones (CBB, left) and Western blot analysis using antibody to monoubiquitylated H2A (uH2A, center) or trimethylated H3-K27 (meK27, right).

Differentiation Linked Stabilization of uH2A on the Inactive X Chromosome

To further examine the relationship between H2A ubiquitylation and the onset of X inactivation, we analyzed XY ES cell lines expressing an inducible Xist transgene. Previous studies have shown that expression of Xist transgenes in undifferentiated ES cells is sufficient to induce gene silencing and many of the chromatin modifications associated with X inactivation (Wutz and Jaenisch, 2000; Kohlmaier et al., 2004). We assayed Xist expression, recruitment of PRC2 (Suz12), PRC1 (Ring1B), H3-K27 trimethylation, and H2A ubiquitylation 72 hr following induction of Xist RNA in two independently derived ES cell lines, 8A and 12E (Figure 4A). Accumulation of Xist RNA into large nuclear domains occurred in the majority of cells in both cell lines. Recruitment of Suz12 and Ring1B and trimethylation of H3-K27 occurred in a reduced proportion of cells. Most strikingly, H2A ubiquitylation was detectable only in a very small proportion of cells.

Chromosome inactivation is unstable and Xist RNA dependent in undifferentiated ES cells and also during early differentiation stages, whereas in more differentiated cells, silencing is stabilized and becomes Xist independent (Wutz and Jaenisch, 2000). To determine if H2A ubiquitylation correlates with stabilization of inactivation, we assayed 8A and 12E cell lines during in vitro differentiation. Xist RNA expression was again induced for 72 hr, but under culture conditions where cell differentiation is allowed to proceed (Figure 4B). Recruitment of Suz12 and Ring1B was seen to increase relative to undifferentiated ES cells, as did H3-K27 trimethylation. The most dramatic difference, however, was seen for H2A ubiquitylation, which was now detectable in a similar proportion of cells as H3-K27 trimethylation (compare Figures 4A and 4B graphs). These observations indicate that cellular differentiation enhances both H3-K27 trimethylation and in particular H2A ubiquitylation occurring in response to Xist RNA accumulation. The fact that these histone modifications are relatively unstable in undifferentiated ES cells may be significant in relation to the reversibility of chromosome inactivation.

Ring1B Is Required for H2A Ubiquitylation in ES Cells

The correlation between H2A ubiquitylation and the recruitment of Ring finger proteins of the PRC1 complex
Figure 4. Ubiquitylated H2A on Xi Is Stabilized by Cellular Differentiation

(A) Examples showing Xist RNA FISH (top), immunofluorescence detection of Suz12 and Ring1B (center), and immunofluorescence detection of tri-meH3-K27 (meK27) and uH2A (bottom) in undifferentiated transgenic 8A ES cells 72 hr after Xist induction. Arrowhead illustrates a cell with a tri-meH3-K27 domain and no corresponding uH2A signal. Graph shows the proportion of cells with domains for each marker (n > 200), both for cell line 8A and the independently derived cell line 12E. Error bars indicate variation between different slides.

(B) Analysis of differentiating cells 72 hr after Xist induction, as in (A). Examples shown are from the 8A cell line.

to Xi suggested that these events may be directly linked. Ring1B in particular represented a good candidate, as previous studies have shown that null alleles result in early embryonic lethality (Voncken et al., 2003; M.V. and H.K., unpublished). To test this, we analyzed the effect of Ring1B deficiency on H2A ubiquitylation. Because of embryonic lethality in Ring1B null animals, we used a conditional gene targeting strategy in which exon 2, encoding the ATG initiation codon, is flanked with loxP sites (Figure 5A). Two independently derived ES cell lines, 10-3 and 13-3, which are homozygous for the conditionally targeted allele (Ring1Bfl/fl), were used in this study. 10-3 cells were found to be XY based on PCR analysis of the Y-linked Sry gene (data not shown). 13-3 cells were Sry negative, indicating they are either XX or X0. Ring1B null (Ring1B+/−) derivatives of both cell lines were obtained by CRE-mediated excision of exon 2.

We went on to analyze global ubiquitylated H2A levels in nuclear extracts before and after deletion of the locus. As shown in Figure 5B, loss of functional Ring1B resulted in a striking depletion of uH2A in both cell lines. Similar results were obtained by analyzing acid-extracted histones (Figure 5C, center). A low level of uH2A was observed in this experiment, possibly due to expression of the highly related Ring1A protein (see below). H3-K27 trimethylation levels were essentially unaffected (Figure 5C, right), demonstrating that depletion of uH2A is a highly specific effect and is not due to a more general disruption of chromatin structure.

To test if depletion of global uH2A levels is a direct consequence of mutating Ring1B, we carried out a complementation experiment, transfecting mutant ES cells with a construct expressing wild-type Ring1B from a heterologous chicken β-actin promoter. As shown in Figure 5D, the transfected mutant ES cells express high levels of transgene-encoded Ring1B protein. Analysis of acid-extracted histones demonstrated that uH2A levels
Figure 5. Ring1B Is Required for H2A Ubiquitylation in ES Cells

(A) Schematic restriction enzyme map illustrating the strategy for conditional targeting of the Ring1B locus. The targeting construct introduces loxP sites (filled triangles) flanking exon (open rectangles) 2 of the gene, containing the ATG initiation codon. An additional loxP site provides a means to delete the positive selectable marker gene, PGKneo. The termination codon TGA is also indicated. A cassette encoding diphtheria toxin expressed from the PGK promoter (PGKDTA) was used to negatively select for random integrants. Restriction enzymes are BglII (B), EcoRI (E), and HindIII (H).

(B) Western blot analysis of uH2A in nuclear extracts from Ring1Bfl/fl (fl/fl) and derivative Ring1B+/H11002+/H11002 (H11002/H11002) 10-3 and 13-3 undifferentiated ES cell lines. Coomassie brilliant blue (CBB) staining of extracts with molecular weights in kDa illustrated to the left.

(C) Western blot analysis of uH2A and tri-meH3-K27 (meK27) in acid-extracted histones from 13-3 cell lines. Positions of histones H1, H2A, H2B, H3, and H4 are indicated to the left of Coomassie brilliant blue (CBB) stained gel image.

(D and E) Complementation analysis of Ring1B+/+ ES cells. (D) Western analysis of Ring1B protein expression in nuclear extracts from XX 10-3 Ring1b fl/fl cells (fl/fl), Ring1b+/H11002+/H11002 derivatives (H11002/H11002), and Ring1b+/H11002+/H11002 cells after transfection with the Ring1B-myc construct (transf). Coomassie brilliant blue (CBB) staining with molecular weights indicated in kDa is shown in the left panel. The epitope-tagged protein (arrowhead a) migrates more slowly than wild-type protein (arrowhead b).

(E) Western analysis of acid-extracted histones from cell lines in (D) showing detection of both uH2A and tri-meH3-K27 (meK27). Coomassie brilliant blue (CBB) staining and indication of the position of histones is shown in the left panel.

are restored to a similar level to the parent Ring1Bfl/fl cells (Figure 5E). These results confirm that Ring1B has a direct involvement in H2A ubiquitylation in ES cells.

Functional Redundancy of Ring1A and Ring1B in X Inactivation

Karyotypic analysis of the putative XX cell line 13-3 revealed that the majority of cells are tetraploid with three X chromosomes (not shown). Theoretically, these cells should initiate inactivation of at least one of their three X chromosomes upon differentiation. Analysis of Xist RNA expression demonstrated that this is the case, although the onset of expression occurred relatively late compared with other XX ES cell lines, between 4 and 11 days of differentiation, and was seen only in a small proportion of cells (Figure 6A, graph). This was also the case for the parent Ring1Bfl/fl cell line, indicating that it represents a property of the parent cell line, rather than a consequence of Ring1B mutation (not shown). We went on to analyze Xi H3-K27 trimethylation and H2A ubiquitylation in these cells (Figure 6A). In all cases where Xi domains could be identified by tri-meH3-K27 staining, we also detected colocalizing uH2A signal. The frequency of positive cells was similar to the proportion of cells expressing Xist RNA.

A possible explanation for the occurrence of uH2A on
Figure 6. Overlapping Function of Ring1B and Ring1A in H2A Ubiquitylation on Xi

(A) Example of immunofluorescence analysis illustrating colocalizing uH2A and tri-meH3K27 (meK27) signals on Xi in 10-3 Ring1B−/− ES cells after 11 days of differentiation. Graph illustrates scoring data showing the proportion of cells with Xi foci for Xist RNA, tri-meH3-K27 (meK27), and uH2A after 4 and 11 days differentiation (dd).

(B) Western blot analysis showing expression profiles for Ring1B and Ring1A proteins in PGK12.1 XX ES cells and after in vitro differentiation for 3, 6, 9, and 12 days (dd). Molecular weights in kDa are indicated to the left. Detection of LaminB protein was used as a loading control.

(C) Example showing immunofluorescence detection of Ring1B in 2-8 MEF cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1Bfl/fl) without or with Ad-Cre virus treatment (Ctrl and Virus, respectively).

(D) Top panels show Western blot analysis for Ring1A and Ring1B in extracts from 1-4 MEF cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1Bfl/fl), and 2-8 MEF cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1B−/−) either without (Ctrl) or with (V) Ad-Cre treatment. Lower panels show Western analysis of uH2A and tri-meH3-K27 (meK27). Molecular weights in kDa are indicated on the left. Detection of LaminB protein was used as a loading control.

(E) Upper graphs illustrate the proportion of 1-4 MEF cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1B−/−) and 2-8 MEF cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1B−/−) showing nuclear Ring1B staining without (Ctrl) or with (V) AdCre treatment. Lower graphs show the proportion of cells with uH2A Xi foci. Data for each point was compiled from scoring a minimum of 1167 cells on a total of four slides. Error bars illustrate variation between slides.

(F) Example of immunofluorescence analysis for uH2A and tri-meH3-K27 (meK27) in 2-8 cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1B−/−) following Ad-Cre treatment. Arrow indicates a single cell with uH2A still present. Other cells lack detectable uH2A. Arrowhead indicates tri-meH3-K27 on Xi in one of these cells.
Xi in differentiated Ring1B−/− cells is functional redundancy with the highly similar Ring1A protein. Consistent with this, Western blot analysis reveals Ring1A expression in ES cells and differentiated derivatives. Ring1B expression, in contrast, is reduced in more differentiated cells (Figure 6B).

To analyze possible redundancy of Ring1A and Ring1B, we derived cell lines lacking both proteins. Ring1B deficiency results in early embryonic lethality, but Ring1A null animals are viable, and we were therefore able to derive Ring1A-deficient XX primary mouse embryo fibroblasts (MEF) homozygous for the conditional Ring1B allele (primary cell line 1-8). A control, we derived XX MEFs homozygous for Ring1B0 on a wild-type Ring1A background (primary cell line 1-4). Subsequent deletion of Ring1B was achieved by infection of MEF cultures with adenovirus expressing CRE recombinase (Ad-Cre).

Typical infection rates, as assessed by immunofluorescence detection of Ring1B protein, varied from 50% to 70% of cells (see Figure 6C for example). Ring1B depletion was clearly evident in Western analysis of infected cell cultures, as was depletion of global uH2A levels (Figure 6D). Interestingly, uH2A depletion appeared to be more marked in 2-8 cells lacking both Ring1A and Ring1B, consistent with an overlapping function for these proteins.

We went on to analyze uH2A on Xi. In control experiments, we noted that Ring1B−/− MEF cells are selected against during continuous culture and that this occurs predominantly between days 3 and 5 (data not shown). With this in mind, we analyzed cells 2 days after Ad-Cre infection, allowing sufficient time to detect effects on uH2A levels prior to the occurrence of cell selection. Figure 6E summarizes the results from two independent experiments. Examples are shown in Figure 6F. Approximately 50% of cells in 1-4 and 2-8 cultures treated with Ad-Cre were seen to lack Ring1B protein, as assessed by immunofluorescence (Figure 6E, top). In 1-4 cells (Ring1A+/−; Ring1B−/−), uH2A on Xi was detectable in approximately 60% of cells both in Ad-Cre-treated and untreated cultures (Figure 6E, bottom left). This result, demonstrating maintenance of uH2A on Xi in Ring1B null cells, is consistent with that obtained for the Ring1B null differentiated XX ES cell cultures (Figure 6A).

In 2-8 cells (Ring1A−/−; Ring1B0), we again observed uH2A on Xi at normal levels prior to Ad-Cre treatment. This indicates that deletion of Ring1A alone does not affect H2A ubiquitylation on Xi. However, in virus-treated cultures, we observed that the number of cells with uH2A staining on Xi is reduced by approximately 50%, similar to the proportion of cells in which Ring1B is deleted (Figure 6E, bottom right). Thus, uH2A on Xi can be maintained in cells lacking Ring1A or Ring1B but not in cells lacking both proteins. XIST RNA expression and tri-meth3-K27 on Xi were unaffected in Ad-Cre-treated compared with untreated cultures (data not shown), indicating that depletion of uH2A on Xi is a direct effect of the combined deletion of Ring1A and Ring1B.

**H2A Ubiquitylation and PRC1 Proteins in Evolution**

H2A ubiquitylation is known to occur in many but not all eukaryotic organisms. A well-documented exception is the yeast S. cerevisiae (Robzyk et al., 2000). S. cerevisiae also has no direct homologs of PRC1 PcG proteins.

![Figure 7. Evolution of H2A Ubiquitylation and PcG Proteins](image)

Illustrated are summarized results of blast searches for homologs of the core PRC1 and PRC2 proteins, designated according to nomenclature of *D. melanogaster* proteins. Blast searches were carried out using protein sequences of both *M. musculus* and *D. melanogaster* proteins. Homologs were identified based on similarity over much of the protein. Thus, proteins that showed homology only in the Ring finger, SET, or chromodomain were not considered as true PcG homologs. Species where clear homologs could be identified are indicated (+). Asterisks indicate that more than one direct homolog exists in that species. Shown below are acid-extracted histones purified from the different species (CBB) and the Western blot analysis using antibodies to histone H3 (H3), tri-meth3-K27 (mK27), and uH2A.

We were interested in examining other organisms to determine to what extent the occurrence of PRC1 proteins correlates with the presence of uH2A (Figure 7). We focused on organisms for which relatively complete genome sequence is available to allow us to identify putative homologs of the *Drosophila melanogaster* PRC1 (PC, PH, PSC, and dRING) and PRC2 (EZ, ESC, and SUZ12) core proteins.

We went on to determine the presence of uH2A and tri-meth3-K27 by Western blot analysis of acid-extracted histones. Detection of histone H3 provided a positive control. No homologs of either PRC1 or PRC2 proteins could be identified in the genome of the slime mold *Dictyostelium discoideum*. Consistent with this, neither H3-K27 trimethylation nor uH2A ubiquitylation could be detected by Western blot analysis. *Arabidopsis thaliana* has homologs of the PRC2 proteins EZ, ESC, and SUZ12 and is also known to have H3-K27 trimethylation. There are, however, no PRC1 homologs present. Again, consistent with predictions, we detected H3-K27 trimethylation but no uH2A. Analysis of *Caenorhabditis elegans*
revealed an unexpected result. PRC2 homologs and H3-K27 trimethylation are known to be present in this organism, and indeed we detected extremely high levels of trimethylation on Xi by Western blot. However, we also detected significant levels of uH2A, despite the absence of dRING, PSC, and PC homologs.

Analysis of organisms representing a number of other kingdoms, i.e., insects (Drosophila melanogaster), fish (Danio rerio), amphibians (Xenopus tropicalis), birds (Gallus gallus), and mammals (Mus m. domesticus), revealed in all cases the presence of both PRC1 and PRC2 homologs. In all of these organisms, we detected significant levels both of H3-K27 trimethylation and H2A ubiquitylation. Overall, these results demonstrate that uH2A is present in organisms with dRING, PSC, and PC homologs. However, in C. elegans at least, other factors may be involved in H2A ubiquitylation.

Discussion

In this study, we have shown that a subset of PRC1 PcG proteins, including the Ring finger proteins Ring1B and Mel18, are recruited to the inactive X chromosome in early development. Coincident with this, we observe chromosome-wide ubiquitylation of histone H2A, suggesting a direct link between these events. In support of this, we show that deletion of Ring1B alone is sufficient to deplete global levels of uH2A in ES cells, while depletion of uH2A on Xi requires deletion of Ring1B and its closely related homolog Ring1A. Our results demonstrate a role for Ring1A/B and PcG complexes in genome-wide H2A ubiquitylation and implicate this histone modification in the maintenance of gene silencing.

H2A Ubiquitylation in X Inactivation

The close correlation of PRC1 enrichment on Xi and the appearance of uH2A, both in normal development and in differentiating ES cells, provided evidence that these events are linked. This was confirmed in analysis of cells lacking both Ring1B and Ring1A proteins. Some questions, however, remain. First, given that PRC1 enrichment on Xi is transient in early development, how is it that uH2A on Xi is maintained in more differentiated cells? Two considerations could be important for this. Detection of PRC1 protein enrichment on Xi by immunofluorescence is a relative measurement, and absence of enrichment does not equate to absence of localization. Clearly, the affinity and avidity of different antibodies will influence the probability of detecting specific nuclear localization patterns. Interchangeability of different PRC1 homologs in Xi-associated complexes also could mask localization of individual components. Thus, although in previous studies we did not detect Xi enrichment of Bmi1 (Mak et al., 2002; Silva et al., 2003), which like Mel18 is a direct homolog of D. melanogaster PSC, we cannot rule out that this protein is present at a lower level in Xi PRC1 complexes. Evidence for interchangeability is provided by the example of Mph2, which is enriched on Xi in TS cells, and Mph1, which is enriched on Xi in differentiating ES cells but not in TS cells.

A further point that needs to be factored is that different PRC1 homologs often show very different expression patterns through development and in different cell types. This is well illustrated by the example of Ring1A and Ring1B proteins. Ring1B is most highly expressed in early development, and deletion of the locus results in early embryo lethality (Voncken et al., 2003; M.V. and H.K., unpublished). Consistent with this, we found that Ring1B-deficient ES cells show extensive depletion of global uH2A levels. Ring1A, in contrast, is more highly expressed in differentiated cell types, and homozygous null animals are viable (Schoorlemmer et al., 1997; del Mar et al., 2000). This, in turn, is consistent with our observation that uH2A on Xi is maintained in differentiated cells by the combined action of Ring1A and Ring1B proteins.

With these facts in mind, it is reasonable to suppose that lower levels of PRC1 complexes or a multiplicity of distinct but functionally equivalent complexes are involved in maintaining uH2A on Xi beyond the time when Ring1B, Mel18, and Mph1/2 protein enrichment is readily detectable. Indeed, a similar situation occurs with the PRC2 complex, where loss of detectable enrichment on Xi in more differentiated cell types is not accompanied by loss of H3-K27 trimethylation (Silva et al., 2003; Plath et al., 2003).

A second open question is the function of H2A ubiquitylation on Xi. We analyzed expression of X-linked genes in Ring1A/B double knockout cells and did not observe evidence for X chromosome reactivation (data not shown). This may in part be because cell selection precluded examining long-term effects of uH2A depletion. It is also possible that other epigenetic modifications, for example DNA methylation, successfully maintain gene silencing in the absence of uH2A. Further studies should address the consequence of uH2A depletion on Xi in the absence of other epigenetic marks, for example tri-methylation of H3-K27.

The Role of H3-K27 Methylation in H2A Ubiquitylation

Recent studies support a model that PRC1 recruitment to the inactive X chromosome is facilitated by binding of the PC chromodomain to tri-methylated H3-K27 (Cao et al., 2002; Kuzmichev et al., 2002; Fischle et al., 2003; Min et al., 2003), and clearly this provides an attractive model to explain PRC1 recruitment and H2A ubiquitylation on Xi. However, some evidence argues against this idea. First, we have been unable to detect Xi enrichment of two of the three mammalian PC homologs, Mpc2 and M33 (Mak et al., 2002; Silva et al., 2003; data not shown). While this does not rule out involvement of a different PC homolog or other chromodomains, a direct interaction of PRC1 proteins with Xist RNA should also be considered. Interestingly, a recent study has identified an RNA binding FCS finger domain in the mouse PRC1 protein Mph1, and a similar domain identified in the C. elegans Polycomb protein SOP-2 was shown to be required for correct localization to nuclear bodies (Zhang et al., 2004).
is consistent with previous work indicating that PRC1 and PRC2 complexes are recruited to distinct as well as shared target loci (Carrington and Jones, 1996; Leslard et al., 1999).

Implications for PRC1 PcG Protein Function
Our observations provide compelling evidence that Ring1A/B PcG proteins play a central role in genome-wide ubiquitylation of histone H2A, most likely functioning as H2A-specific E3 ligases. Indeed, while this manuscript was under revision, Wang et al. (2004) reported that the Ring1B protein is an E3 ligase with specificity for histone H2A lysine 119. This then raises the question of whether or not H2A ubiquitylation is required for the function of the PRC1 PcG complex in maintaining gene silencing. Ring1A/B proteins were initially identified based on two-hybrid interaction with HPC2/M33 (Satijn et al., 1997; Schoorlemmer et al., 1997) and Bmi1/Mel18 (Satijn and Otte, 1999; Suzuki et al., 2002) and therefore were not formally classified as PcG proteins. However, two recent studies have demonstrated mutations in the D. melanogaster homolog of Ring1A/B, dRING, in the classical Polycomb mutation sex combs extra (sce) (Fritsch et al., 2003; Gorfinkiel et al., 2004). The sce mutation was shown to derepress transcription of the Ubx gene, confirming the designation of dRING as a classical PcG protein. Moreover, Ubx derepression was also observed in a hypomorphic sce allele with a point mutation affecting a single residue in the Ring finger domain of the dRING protein (Fritsch et al., 2003). These observations, together with the role of Ring1B in H2A ubiquitylation, suggest that this histone modification is important for gene repression by PRC1 PcG protein complexes.

A large body of evidence demonstrates that PRC1 can interfere both with chromatin remodeling and transcription through an energy-independent interaction with chromatin templates (Shao et al., 1999; Francis et al., 2001; Levine et al., 2002; King et al., 2002). How can these observations be reconciled with our data implicating H2A ubiquitylation as a mechanism of PRC1 function? A possible explanation is that PRC1 and remodeling/transcription complexes compete for core nucleosomal surfaces in vitro and that this occurs independent of H2A ubiquitylation. This mechanism was indeed proposed by Francis et al. (2001) to account for the fact that chromatin templates must be pretreated with PRC1 complexes in order to inhibit SWI-SNF activity in vitro.

Assuming that H2A ubiquitylation is important for PRC1 function in the maintenance of gene repression, how might this occur? Both direct and indirect mechanisms can be envisaged. The large size of the ubiquitin group compared to other histone modifications would be consistent with it interfering directly with nucleosome dynamics during transcription. Perhaps relevant to this is evidence indicating that H2A/H2B dimers are dislodged from nucleosomes during transcription by RNA polymerase II (Kireeva et al., 2002; Belotserkovskaya et al., 2003). Such a model would also be consistent with recent experiments demonstrating that PcG complexes interfere with initiation of transcription but not with recruitment of TBP and RNA polymerase II (Dellino et al., 2004). An indirect model, postulating recruitment of effector proteins to mono-ubiquitylated H2A, is also compatible with the aforementioned observations. Alternatively, uH2A may function through a transhistone regulatory pathway, as has been reported for H2B ubiquitylation in S. cerevisiae (Sun and Allis, 2002; Dover et al., 2002; Briggs et al., 2002). Loss of uH2A in Ring1B–/– ES cells had no obvious impact on H3-K27 methylation levels (Figure 4E), but other modifications have not yet been analyzed.

Experimental Procedures

Mouse Strains, Embryos, and Cell Lines
Preimplantation and postimplantation mouse embryos were isolated from timed matings of C57Bl6 × CBA/F1 animals as described previously (Sheardown et al., 1998; Silva et al., 2003). Derivation and maintenance of XX ES cells (PGK12.1), XX TS cells (B7), and XY TS cells (B1) is described in detail by Penny et al. (1996) and Mak et al. (2002). Adult and embryonic XX fibroblast cells and cell lines were derived as previously (Duthie et al., 1999; Silva et al., 2003). XY ES cell lines 8A and 12E carry inducible Xist transgenes integrated into random autosomal sites. They were established essentially as described by Wutz and Jaenisch (2000), except that the pTRE-tight vector (Clontech) was used to clone full-length Xist cDNA (further details available on request). Transgenic Xist RNA was undetectable in uninduced cells. Xist expression was induced by culturing in the presence of 1 μg/ml doxycycline.

Ring1A-deficient mice were as described previously (del Mar et al., 2000). Full details of conditional gene targeting of Ring1B and analysis of Ring1B–/– embryos will be provided in a subsequent manuscript (M.V. and H.K., unpublished). The 10-3 and 13-3 ES cell lines were derived from blastocysts from crosses between homozygous Ring1Bfl/fl animals. Conditional deletion of Ring1B was carried out by transient transfection with the pCRE-Pac plasmid expressing CRE recombinase, as described by Taniguchi et al. (1998). Cell lines were tested for the presence of a Y chromosome by PCR analysis of the Y-linked Sry gene. Complementation analysis was carried out using a Ring1B cDNA construct with an N-terminal myc Tag cloned into the chicken β-actin promoter construct pCXN2 (Niwa et al., 1991). 10-3 Ring1B–/– ES cells were transfected using Lipofectamin 2000 following standard protocols. Pooled stable transfectants were expanded under G418 selection prior to extraction of proteins for Western blot analysis.

CRE-mediated deletion of Ring1B in MEF cell lines using AdCre virus was carried out as described previously (Kanegae et al., 1995).

Antibodies
For immunofluorescence (IF) and Westerns (W), the following antibodies and dilutions were used: rabbit polyclonal antibodies to Su(z)12 from Upstate (1:200 in IF); rabbit polyclonal Met18 (H-115) from Santa Cruz Biotechnology (1:50 in IF); rabbit monoclonal antibody clone FK1 from Affiniti research products, which recognizes polyubiquitylated proteins (1:50 in IF); mouse monoclonal antibody clone FK1 from Affiniti research products, which recognizes polyubiquitylated proteins (1:50 in IF); mouse monoclonal IgM anti-ubiquitylated-histone H2A (clone E6C5) from Upstate (1:500 in IF and 1:400 in W); mouse monoclonal antibody clone FK1 from Affiniti research products, which recognizes polyubiquitylated proteins (1:50 in IF); mouse monoclonal IgG anti-ubiquitylated-histone H2A (clone E6C5) from Upstate (1:500 in IF and 1:400 in W); and rabbit polyclonal antibody to Histone H3-Chip grade (ab1791) from Abcam (1:10,000 in W). Antibodies to Eed, Ezh2, HP1 H1, RING1A, RING1B, and tri-methyl-K27 (6523) have been previously described (Sewalt et al., 1998; Satijn et al., 1997; Asutina et al., 2001; Peters et al., 2003). Mouse monoclonal antibody to Mph2 will be described in detail in a subsequent communication (H.K., unpublished).

Immunofluorescence and RNA FISH
For immunofluorescence, TS cells, fibroblasts, and cells from trypanosome-dissociated postimplantation embryos were placed on slides in medium and left to attach for 2–4 hr. Generally for Eed, Ezh2, Su(z)12, Ring1B, Mel18, Mph1, Mph2, and tri-methylK27 antibodies, cells were rinsed in PBS, fixed in 2% paraformaldehyde (PFA) for 15 min at room temperature, rinsed in PBS, and permeabilized for 5 min in...
0.4% Triton X. For FK2, FK1, and uH2A antibodies, or double labeling experiments including any of these, cells were first permeabilized and then fixed. In ES cell differentiation experiments, cells were resuspended in PBS at a concentration of 1 × 10^6 cells/ml. For FK2, FK1, uH2A, and tri-methyl-H3-K27 antibodies, cells were cytospun onto slides in PBS (100 µl/slide, 8 min, 1800 rpm). Slides were rinsed in PBS, permeabilized, and fixed. When using Eed, Suz12, Ring1B, Mel18, and H3K27 antibodies, cells were resuspended to the same concentration in 2% PFA, fixed for 15 min at room temperature, cytospun onto slides in 2% PFA (100 µl/slide, 8 min, 1800 rpm), rinsed in PBS, and permeabilized. Immunofluorescence was carried out as described by Mak et al. (2002). Procedures for immunofluorescence on preimplantation embryos have been described previously (Silva et al., 2003). For cytospun cells, Xist RNA FISH was essentially carried out as described in Duthie et al. (1999), except that after 25 min fixation on ice, cells were cytospun in fixation solution. For cells plated on slides, RNA FISH was carried out as described in Silva et al. (2003). Images were acquired on a Leica DMRB microscope equipped with a CCD camera or on a Leica SP1 confocal microscope.

Extracts and Western Blot Analysis
Histone extractions from mouse tissue culture cells were performed as follows. Trypsinized cells were washed in PBS and pellets were flash-frozen. When preparing histones from ES cells, in order to minimize feeder contamination, cells were plated repeatedly for periods of 10–30 min on nonadherent plates. Frozen cell pellets of approximately 100 µl were rapidly thawed, washed in ice-cold PBS containing protease inhibitors, spun down (4 min, 235 × g), resuspended in ice-cold PBS containing protease inhibitors, and incubated on ice for 10 min. After centrifugation, pellets were resuspended in 1 ml of ice cold 0.2 M HSO4 and incubated on ice for 30 min. Samples were then spun down (2 min, 20,200 × g). The supernatant was precipitated by adding TCA to a final concentration of 25% and leaving on ice for 30 min. Precipitated histones were pelleted (10 min, 20,200 × g), washed twice by adding 1 ml of ice cold acetone and incubating 10 min on ice. After centrifugation (10 min, 20,200 × g), pellets were dissolved in 100 mM Tris (pH 7.6).

Histone extractions from A. italiana, C elegans, X. tropicalis (liver), D. rerio, D. melanogastor, and D. melanogastor Schneider 2 cells, and G. gallus DT140 cells were processed as described by Jackson et al. (2004). Specifically, material was ground with a mortar and pestle under liquid nitrogen and resuspended in NIB buffer (15 mM PIPES [pH 6.8], 5 mM MgCl2, 60 mM KCl, 0.25 sucrose, 15 mM NaCl, 1 mM CaCl2, 0.8% Triton X100 containing protease inhibitors). The supernatant was precipitated by adding 2 vol acetone and leaving on ice for 30 min. After centrifugation, pellets were dissolved in 100 mM Tris (pH 7.6). Whole-cell and nuclear extracts were prepared as described previously (Mermoud et al., 1998).

For Western blotting, 5 µg of the histone extracts were loaded per lane and electrophoresed by SDS-PAGE using 8%–16% gradient gels. Westerns were performed following the protocols provided by each antibody supplier. Secondary antibodies were polyclonal goat anti-mouse immunoglobulins/HRP (DakoCyntation), sheep anti-mouse IgG HPR linked (Amersham), and donkey anti-rabbit Ig HPR linked (Amersham). ECL detection (Amersham) was carried out according to manufacturer’s recommendations.

Acknowledgments
We would like to thank Catherine Pears and Louis Mahadevan for histone preparations from Dictyostelium discoideum; Vincent Colot, Justin Goodrich, Peter Shaw, Bill Earnshaw, Mario de Bonno, James Briscoe, Lyle Zimmerman, and Fillipa Carreira-Barbosa for materials and help with histone preparation from various species; Izumo Saito and Masakatsu Yamashita for Ad-Cre virus; Thomas Jenuwein for antibodies; and other lab members for critical reading of the manuscript. This work was supported by the Medical Research Council, UK, by Special Coordination Funds for Promoting Science and Technology from the Japanese Government, and by the DGI, Spanish Ministry of Education and Science (SAF2001-2211-C02-01). M.D.N. is supported by Programa Gulbenkian de Doutoramento em Biologia e Medicina, Portugal.

Received: August 19, 2004
Revised: October 14, 2004
Accepted: October 15, 2004
Published online: November 1, 2004

References


Duthie, S.M., Nesterova, T.B., Formstone, E.J., Keohane, A.M.,


The Polycomb-Group genes eed and Bmi1 in hemopoietic cell proliferation. Genes Dev. 13, 2691–2703.


transcriptional repressor that interacts with the Polycomb-M33 protein and is expressed at rhombomere boundaries in the mouse hindbrain. EMBO J. 16, 5930–5942.


